



**CHANDIGARH POLICE  
OFFICE OF THE SENIOR SUPERINTENDENT OF POLICE-CUM-1<sup>st</sup> APPELLATE  
AUTHORITY (UNDER RTI ACT 2005), UT, CHANDIGARH.**

Appeal Order No. **D-245-247** /UT/RTI/SSP, dated : **14.08.2024**  
Name of Appellant : Sh. Avtar Singh  
R/o H. No. 2105/1, Sector-40 C,  
Chandigarh.  
Concerned CPIO : CPIO/South- West  
Date of RTI application : 28.06.2024  
Reply of CPIO : 11.07.2024  
Date of 1<sup>st</sup> Appeal : 19.07.2024

**ORDER**

The appellant has preferred his 1<sup>st</sup> appeal dated 19.07.2024 against the disposal of his RTI application dated 28.06.2024 by CPIO/South-West with the contentions that requisite information was not provided to him.

**Information sought vide RTI application:-**

The appellant vide his RTI application dated 28.06.2024 has raised queries i.e. If three persons caught hold of one person and put red chilli powder in his eyes and also steal his ring, then FIR under which section will be registered.

**COMMENTS OF CPIO/South-West :-**

CPIO/South-West vide his comments submitted that RTI application was received in his office to obtain information i.e. If three persons caught hold of one person and put red chilli powder in his eyes and also steal his ring, then FIR under which section will be registered. Thereafter, requisite information was obtained from SHO/PS-39 and the same was denied to the appellant u/s 2(f) of RTI Act as the information sought was in questionnaire form. Appellant was apprised about the same vide letter no. 155-RTI/CPIO/South West dated 11.07.2024.

**DECISION :-**

I have gone through the contents of RTI application, appeal of the appellant, comments of CPIO/South-West vis-à-vis material available on record which revealed that the appellant has sought information i.e. If three persons caught hold of one person and put red chilli powder in his eyes and also steal his ring, then FIR under which section will be registered.

In reply, CPIO/South-West has denied to provide the requisite information to the appellant as the sought information is not as per the provisions mentioned under section 2 (f) of RTI Act, 2005.

Now as far as the appeal is concerned, CPIO has appropriately denied the sought information to the appellant as the appellant has raised queries/questions for nature of registration of FIR, which is not entertainable under RTI Act and falls outside the purview of section 2(f) of RTI Act.

Moreover, Hon'ble High Court of Bombay vide its order dated 03.04.2008 in case titled as "Dr. Celsa Pinto Vs. Goa State Information Commission (W.P.No.419 of 2007)" categorically explained the issue as under :-

*"The definition (of information) cannot include within its fold answers to the question "why" which would be the same thing as asking the reason for a justification for a particular thing. The Public Information Authorities cannot expect to communicate to the citizen the reason why a certain thing was done or not done in the sense of a justification because the citizen makes a requisition about information. Justifications are matter within the domain of adjudicating authorities and cannot properly be classified as information."*

Similarly, Hon'ble Central Information Commission, New Delhi in Complaint No.CIC/RBIND/C/2020/664244 titled as "Shishir Gupta Vs. Reserve Bank of India also cleared the matter as under :-

*"The CPIO cannot create information in the manner as sought by the applicant. The CPIO is only a communicator of information based on the records held in the office and hence, he cannot expected to do research work to deduce anything from the material therein and then supply it to him".*

With these observations, instant appeal stands disposed off.

In case, the appellant is not satisfied with the disposal of his appeal, he can file second appeal before the Hon'ble CIC, CIC Bhawan, Baba Gangnath Marg, Munirka, New Delhi-110067 under the RTI Act within 90 days.

(Kanwardeep Kaur, IPS)  
Senior Superintendent of Police  
Union Territory, Chandigarh-cum-  
1<sup>st</sup> Appellate Authority.

Sh. Avtar Singh,  
R/o H No. 2105/1, Sector-40 C  
Chandigarh  
Mobile No. 88721-50150

Copies to :-

1 CPIO/South-West  
2 Computer Section.